

PhD Viva Voce Presentation

By

KWAKU OFOSU-ADARKWA

**TOPIC: ICT-Enabled Governance :Towards
A Model of Engagement of Rural
And Local Communities**

Purpose of the Study

The study explored and developed a model to enhance citizens' engagement in governance that will embrace the collaborative partnership of rural and local communities to impact on real public value creation based on trust.

RESEARCH PROBLEM

(1) The Basis/Background:

- *The Research Problem Setting:*
- The traditional role of government entails the provision of public goods and services of value to meet citizens' needs. In ensuring good governance, transparency and trust are crucial for government and citizens' engagement. Opinions have, however, been expressed, that public sector reforming paradigms that evolved in the past, had not been participatory enough. They did not promote the inclusion of the citizenry at the local and community levels, whose contribution to the development of real public value is essential.
- The low perception of public trust by the citizenry in governments is a drawback to collaborative development. Consequently, governments continue to search for new ways to enhance trust in the public sector governance that in turn will improve their relationships with the citizenry, especially at the community level.

RESEARCH PROBLEM CONT.

The Basis/Background Cont.

- With the advent of ICT over two decades ago, therefore, optimistic opinions have been expressed that it holds the key to enable effective diffusion of ICT to embrace the inclusion of the citizenry at the local and community levels and thereby enhance trust and real public value creation in governance to benefit all.
- While the potential of ICT, to enhance inclusion, has been variously expressed by researchers, few attempts have been made to assess the effects of ICT governance systems, their impacts on engagement of rural communities such that a conceptual framework will evolve to move the local community to become ‘active citizens’; Misuraca (2007).

RESEARCH PROBLEM CONT.

- *Prior Research Efforts:*

- Previous works identified the need to promote the inclusiveness of the local citizenry in governance and have made various contributions. However, these contributions have been championed from disparate points of view i.e. globalization and technology convergence; culture clash, empowerment and policy decision making etc.
- On account of the enormous awareness the subject matter has received, many researchers have indicated the need for further studies to come out with a “multi-dimensional” governance framework that will positively respond to the priorities of the citizenry, inclusive those at the community level; Heeks (2002); Finger and Peacod (2003); Riley (2003); Goldsmith (2004); Misuraca 2007.

RESEARCH PROBLEM CONT.

The Basis/Background Cont.

(2) The Research Gap:

The gap is the development of a conceptual framework that will assess the effects of ICT on governance systems and their systematic and evolutionary impact on the inclusion of the citizenry, in a manner to enhance real public value reform that continually embraces the local and rural communities.

(3) Why Address Research Gap:

The gap is addressed to contribute to enhance the integrated engagement and partnership of governance systems, institutions and the citizenry at the local level and thereby help bridge the phenomenon of digital divide to aid collaborative and inclusive development.

SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

❖ Practice:

- Research Finding 1: International and national governance entities appreciate engagement in the policy decision making process but the high level of commitment has evidently not been translated to affect the local communities
- Implications:
There is the need for practical participation of the citizenry to promote culture of bottom-up ownership of policy development . [PF]
- *Beyond diffusion of technology to propel ICT-enabled Governance, public management reforming should of necessity move from the centre to empower community level actors to promote inclusiveness [PF]*
- Research Finding 2: Meeting citizens' expectation of good governance characteristics drives ICT-enabled governance initiatives yet value drivers are external to the citizenry making them unresponsive to innovative and dynamic changes.
- Implications:
There is the need to align governance and organizational focus with the knowledge and needs of the citizenry so trust and confidence would become inevitable in the relationships. [PF] (TD) Trust
- Research Finding 3: Robust/seamless connectivity to aid the use of modern IT tools for communication and collaboration to aid decentralised networking has eluded the local areas thus thwarting Web.2.0 deployment.
- Implications:
The need to make broadband accessible and affordable to all and also facilitate education from demand-side perspective. [PF]

SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

❖ Policy

- Research Finding 4: Policies on local content development, M-Gov, equity and access, broadband universalization, citizen education from broadband demand-side perspective, aided by capacity development are essential to promote digital inclusion
- Implications: *ICT-enabled Governance as public management reforming tool should be backed by M-Gov, local content, open data and capacity development policies to encourage uptake to promote inclusiveness [PR] Digital Illiteracy reduction*

❖ Theoretical:

- Research Finding 5: Other numerous, but less apparent, distracting factors aside the problem of lack of inclusion affects ICT and citizen engagement.
- Implications:
- *The need for the development of a framework of governance that is continuously assessed to empower the society to become highly pluralistic at all levels, conducive for continuous knowledge sharing and management, empowering the citizenry in the centre to embrace innovation and dynamic changes and processes that ICT offers in governance on continuous and reiterative basis.*

LITERATURE REVIEW

- Since the works of Rogers (1995) and Wendt and Westarp (1999) the **importance of diffusion of ICT into social systems** based on its “positive network effect” and “opinion leadership” strength to enhance the standards of consultation has **been advocated**.
- Briathwaite & Levi (1998) also **advocated** for the development of the culture of **trust as an indispensable prerequisite to guide changes in relationships** and structures under an ICT-enabled governance system.
- Heeks (2002); Finger and Pecoud (2003); Rogers (2003); Misuraca (2007); identified **the need for additional study on the assessment and fusing of relationships** between ICT-enabled governance and citizens’ involvement especially at local level on account of growing awareness;
- They all contended that **standards of consultation** and their key determinants **ought to be well defined in processes** that acknowledge values of the citizenry to promote new partnership of engagement.

LITERATURE REVIEW CONT.

- Notably, key researchers looked at the issue further from the lens of globalization, technological convergence, structural changes, transformation, and proposed that the impact of “the Third Sector” on future governance that embrace the local community remains a gap to be addressed in further study; Finger et al. (2003 & 2007)
- On the part of Goldsmith and Eggers (2004); (Kim 2005) behaviour consequences between governments, institutions and the citizenry was the gap they identified for further evaluation towards the development of a network knowledge framework;
- From the point of view of (Misuraca (2007) the lack of empowerment for community leaders, women and other marginalised groups, particularly in Africa, that leads to perceived and not real potential of their involvement in governance at the local level was a gap future researchers ought to probe to develop an inclusive framework.

LITERATURE REVIEW CONT.

- Prior to these observations theories and paradigms of public sector reform models from TPA (rational/legal authority/insourcing) through NPM (contracting out) to respond to the citizenry need failed to provide **frameworks for effective consultation**; McCourt (1998)
- Not even the introduction of the theory of PVM (Moore, 2006) to bring in the element of trust to help eliminate self seeking motives under TPA in favour of pluralism in the sharing of benefits and challenges in an accountable manner **could fill the gap to move forward the wheel of citizenry participation at local and community levels.**
- Consequently the expressed optimism aside, **the “why” the “how” to fill the study gaps with a framework for networked relationship** has not been comprehensively addressed; Osborne (2010).

LITERATURE REVIEW CONT.

- The “Stages of Growth” model-based approach to public sector governance **appeared not fully functional and involving**; Layne & Lee (2001); Kim 2006
- Other “Stages of e-Gov Maturity” models were also not sufficiently responsive to multi-perspective transformation as they were high-level functional in manner (Misuraca)
- They failed to address the **transformation of inclusive relationship** between government to citizens not to mention the “**third party**” **inclusion** as advocated by Finger et al;
- Accordingly recent call by Karantjais et al (2012), for a **framework to respond to inclusiveness** that will promote connectedness of governments to citizens to create public value based on trust **justifies the need to fill the gap.**

LITERATURE REVIEW CONT.

- The literature reviewed emphasised awareness created, the optimism to create cyber governments with calls for the **introduction of e-democracy as a subset of e-gov**; Martens (2008).
- Gaps in public sector reforming framework that will challenge society and structures to promote trust and communities of practice still persist.
- Findings from study revealed many distracting factors that need to be uprooted under the “iceberg”
- ICT-enabled governance should evolve innovatively
- Continuous knowledge management; degree of empowerment; responsiveness to culture change, all good governance attributes of inclusiveness appear not fully probed.
- Guided by PNT (Koppenjan, 2010) to promote effective network governance in multi-actor setting a new framework evolved.

LITERATURE REVIEW CONT.

- The gap has been addressed by evolving out of the study the Improved Interactive Engagement e-Governance (IIEeGov) Model;
- Attention has been given to the enforcement of diffusion in cyclical complementary manner as proposed by Kim (2005) as essential to provide citizen-centric effects to shape democratic ideals.
- Finger & Pecoud (2003); Finger (2007) proposition that the impact of technology convergence, decentralise partnership; and life long learning be examined and given future consideration in view of globalisation has been given due consideration
- Parsons (1997); Rogers (2003), call for mutuality of actions in dynamic social interaction environment to be considered as essential features has been adhered to.
- Misuraca, (2007) call for a future framework that enforces multi-dimensional and the functional features complementing each other simultaneously to aid change at all levels of engagement has been taken into consideration.
- As anticipated by Moon (2012) crowdsourcing, continuous learning community in an innovative structure should be the guiding principle.

THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUE

- Qualitative mode was applied to a large extent in the gathering of primary data. (Myers (1997); Saunders et al (2007))
- However limited application of quantitative instruments aided data analysis to facilitate classification of observable features.
- In effect the mixed method approach was used in the research; Caracelli and Greene (1997). It allowed retrieval of in-depth info from traditional leaders through interview at their pleasure.

Why Qualitative?

- The exploratory nature offered the opportunity for assessment of complex and interwoven variables from general point of view.
- It also supported the exploration of multifaceted issue of “lack of inclusiveness”.
- Exploratory approach enabled deeper insight of a problem area not succinctly defined thus avoiding descriptive approach as characteristics of a phenomenon was not the issue.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY CONT.

- Qualitative was a suitable method as it facilitated interpretation of data to aid conceptual and theoretical analysis thus avoiding deeper focus on quantitative mode because of the latter's reliance on predictions and causal explanation which was not the focus under exploratory approach for this study; Greener (2008)
- The responses were quantified to capture the frequency of different factors in investigating into the variables (Ghauri and Grouhaung, 2010)

Qualitative How Used:

- Data sources were gathered from both primary and secondary; Durance and Fisher (2005)
- Semi-structured questionnaire/interviews were applied to seek further opinion
- Contact with subjects was relied on to facilitate empirical data gathering.
- The case studies used allowed empirical investigation; Robson (2002)
- For secondary sources previous research works in literature, official statistics, gov't and multinational reports, web information were reviewed
- The researcher participation/observation aided data appreciation
- Overall the data gathered was enriched with independent opinion based on the semi-structured approach

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY CONT.

SAMPLING CHARACTERISTICS

- Purposive sampling was applied to reach the subjects.
- Local communities – Respectable balance of demographic profile from both urban and rural communities (200 Targeted = 146 Responsive)
- Defined generalized groups from Metropolitan/Districts
- Aided the retrieval of in-depth data from traditional leaders (13%)
- International Communities – Small Island States/ Developing/ Developed Countries (80 Sample size = 62 Responsive)
- Policy practitioners/researchers - WSIS/ITU/CTO/Academics etc.

LIMITATION

- A larger sample size would have been desirable to back generalizability of results - hindered by time constraints and cost.

PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

Research Question	Evaluation Performed	Outcome of the Analysis
Q1: What main constructs of good governance are being promoted to lead to participation in governance systems inclusive of citizenry at traditional and local government levels?	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Assess effectiveness and impact of policy process and relationships 2) Establish degree of relational Trust and Transparency 3) Assess the nature of consensus orientation 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Study shows evidence of policy imposition on local sector 2) Absence of identity-based trust 3) Low level consultation/no citizen sourcing 4) Global WSIS/Ghana: Specific call for local policy ownership
Q2: What dimensions of change in governance are evident as public value drivers?	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Assess applicability of good governance drivers to value creation 2) Democratic dispensation 3) Real value decision making process 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Study shows need for the re-engineering of social inclusion 2) Need for engagement to un-pack bottlenecks of good governance
Q3: What level of impacts are ICT-enabled changes having at the local, and traditional governance levels?	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Establish the consultation media and platform preference 2) Examine the degree of change in governance processes 3) Examine the level of imposition 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Study indicates preference for Internet and new IT mode of communication 2) High uptake of Smart phones 3) Need for capacity empowerment 4) Need for Digital Divide study
Q4: What is the extent of the gap in the diffusion of ICT in governance?	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Assess innovation acceptance level 2) Measure ICT Access/Use/Knowledge 3) Degree of culture of confirmation 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Study point to local content deficiency 2) High Digital Illiteracy and seclusion 3) Low uptake of internet -12% Ghana case 4) Low degree of culture of confirmation 5) Absence of Open Data/Datasets/FOI Act
Q5: What dimensions of the ICT-enabled governance structure would lead to a novel model of change embracing the citizenry at the traditional and local government levels?	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Establish what ought to be done in new ways 2) Assess verifiability/relevance of ICT initiatives 3) Seek open-ended opinion pooling to complement findings 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Study revealed need for broader perspective for inclusiveness 2) Attention for cont. knowledge Mg'ment 3) Attention for Diversity issues 4) Crowdsourcing the way forward

DISCUSSIONS OF THE RESULTS

Research Objective	Research Question	Research Findings
Obj 1: To examine the extent to which key global as well as national policy prescriptions address the need for the engagement of the citizenry at local, county and community levels in an ICT-enabled governance environment	Question One: What main constructs of good governance are being promoted to lead to participation in governance systems inclusive of citizenry at traditional and local government levels?	International and national governance entities appreciate engagement in the policy decision making process but the high level of commitment is not evidently translated to affect the local communities.
Obj 2: To assess the key drivers of changes in governance systems and their consequences for ICT-enabled governance in local, county and community levels	Question Two What dimensions of change in governance are evident as public value drivers?	Meeting citizens' expectation of good governance characteristics drives ICT-enabled governance initiatives yet value drivers are external to the citizenry
Obj 3: To examine the degree to which the Processes of Consultation have Promoted Collaborative Partnership and Engagement of Local Communities	Question Three: What level of impacts are ICT-enabled Changes having at the local, and traditional governance levels?	Robust/seamless connectivity to aid the use of modern and IT tools of communication for collaboration to aid decentralised networking has eluded the local areas thwarting Web.2.0 deployment.
Obj 4: To make prescriptions to impact on policy and operational reviews that will promote the engagement of the citizenry at all levels of government.	Question Four: What is the extent of the gap in the diffusion of ICT in governance?	Policies on local content development, M-Gov, equity & access, broadband & education from demand perspective, aided by capacity development are essential to promote digital inclusion.
Obj 5: To develop a Framework to assess the Main Dimensions of Change of ICT-Enabled Gov. Model that will Promote Engagement and Inclusiveness of the Citizen at all levels of Governance Innovatively based on Mutual Trust	Question Five: What dimensions of the ICT-enabled governance structure would lead to a novel model of change embracing the citizenry at the traditional and local government levels?	Other numerous, but less apparent distracting factors aside the problem of lack of inclusiveness affect ICT and citizen engagement. <u>Framework should account for the society to be empowered to become highly pluralistic at all levels innovatively.</u>

DISCUSSIONS OF THE RESULTS CONT.

Findings relate to the following Research Works

Finding 1, 2 , 3, 4 & 5:

- Parsons, (1997) work emphasising the need for governments to align governance and organisational forms to citizenry needs to enhance public value has been confirmed and theory statement extended into the structure and function constructs in the model. (F1&F5)
- Finger (2007) study on the need for citizens to be encouraged to move above awareness of what is being done from the centre to see the benefits has been confirmed and extended into the framework of consultation (F1&F2)
- Marche and Mc Niver, (2003) work on the need for public sector transformation model to respond to the pressure points created by the Internet has been confirmed and attention drawn to the Digital Divide study and interventions on capacity development (F3)
- Finger & Pecoud (2003); Theory on co-evolution, the consideration of future impact of globalization, technology convergence, decentralise partnership; and life long learning as an area that needs critical look to promote inclusion has been confirmed and extended (F4).
- Misuraca, (2007) call for the dev. of a dynamic framework to aid nurturing the potentials and wide range influence that local communities and Chiefs can contribute done (F5)
- Kim (2005) call for the enforcement of diffusion in cyclical complementary manner to provide citizen-centric effects to shape democratic ideals is reinforced.(F5)

DISCUSSIONS OF THE RESULTS CONT.

Implications of Research Findings

Research Findings	Practical Implication	Theoretical Implications	Policy Implications
International and national governance entities appreciate engagement in the policy decision making process but the high level of commitment is not evidently translated to affect the local communities.	WSIS Post 2015 Dev Agenda must review plan and set meaningful global inclusive targets- Ghana to review its 12 year old policy with local inputs	Moore's PVM theory has been given additional impetus with the inclusion of the external authorizing environment at the local communities to aid accountability.	Review of international and local policy blueprints with inputs from the broader communities; re:Road to Dignity by 2030; Connect 2020; Ghana revised & new ICT policy at District Levels
Meeting citizens' expectation of good governance characteristics drives ICT-enabled governance initiatives yet value drivers external to the citizenry	Value creation education has to be sustained through knowledge sharing to build trust in governments	The absence of a common definition for trust and measurement criteria for participation should continue to engage research attention,	Development of Life Long Learning policy to respond to standards of inclusiveness, openness and accountability in the era of ICT
Robust connectivity to aid the use of modern IT tools for communication to aid decentralised networking has eluded the local areas. thwarting Web.2.0 deployment.	Demand side education on benefit of use of IT tools sustained to increase mass uptake	Evans and Wurster (2000) strategic thrust of concepts of "reach" and "richness" has been improved upon and both developed concurrently	Policies on open access to infrastructure of all forms need to be redefined to meet needs of underserved areas in reliable and secured manner
Policies on local content development, equity, citizen education on benefits of broadband demand perspective, aided by capacity development are essential to promote digital inclusion.	Sustained capacity development to minimise both formal illiteracy and digital illiteracy	Finger <i>et al</i> Theory on co-evolution bet Tech, Inst, and Network Indus need to be applied to account for local participation and inclusion	Dev of policies to address mass uptake on ICT tools for interaction in the related areas to close the digital divide. Digital divide study is key.
Other numerous, but less apparent distracting factors aside the problem of lack of inclusiveness affect ICT and citizens engagement thus need to create a guiding framework for citizenry empowerment.	Measurement and assessment criteria for participation needs to be defined and assimilated by all.	Enabling framework to guide reiterative inclusiveness processes towards information society to be developed and continually assessed	Continuous policy review of obstacles to the building of information and knowledge society in pluralistic manner

CONCLUSIONS AND SUMMARY

Research Objective	Research Finding	Research Implication
Obj 1: To examine the extent to which key global as well as national policy prescriptions address the need for the engagement of the citizenry at local, county and community levels in an ICT-enabled governance environment	International and national governance entities appreciate engagement in the policy decision making process but the high level of commitment is not evidently translated to affect the local communities.	Findings should aid the sustenance of the culture of bottom-up ownership of policy development, implementation and monitoring.
Obj 2: To assess the key drivers of changes in governance systems and their consequences for ICT-enabled governance in local, county and community levels	Meeting citizens' expectation of good governance characteristics drives ICT-enabled governance initiatives yet value drivers are external to the citizenry	There is the need to align governance and organizational focus with the needs of the citizenry so trust and confidence would become inevitable in the relationships
Obj 3: The examine the degree to which the Processes of Consultation have Promoted Collaborative Partnership and Engagement of Local Communities	Robust/seamless connectivity to aid the use of modern and IT tools of communication for collaboration to aid decentralised networking has eluded the local areas thwarting Web.2.0 deployment.	There is the need to make broadband assessable and affordable to all and also facilitate education from demand-side ensuring also that the private sector will be motivated to handle the supply side.
Obj 4: To make prescriptions to impact on policy and operational reviews that will promote the engagement of the citizenry at all levels of government.	Policies on local content development, equity, & access, broadband and its benefits from demand perspective, aided by capacity development are essential to promote digital inclusion.	ICT-enabled Governance as public management reforming tool should be backed M-Gov, local content, open data and sustained capacity development policies to encourage uptake to promote inclusiveness
Obj 5: To Develop a Framework to assess the Main Dimensions of Change of ICT-Enabled Governance Model that will Promote the Engagement and Inclusiveness of the Citizenry at all Levels of Governance Innovatively based on Mutual Trust	Other numerous, but less apparent distracting factors aside the problem of lack of inclusiveness affect ICT and citizens engagement. Thus need to create a framework for citizenry empowerment.	Development and continuous review of frameworks of governance to empower society to become highly pluralistic at all levels to aid knowledge sharing and management with the citizenry in the centre to embrace innovative and dynamic changes and processes that ICT offers in governance on continuous and reiterative basis essential.

CONCLUSIONS & SUMMARY CONT.

- The study gap has been filled as follows:-
- The Improved Interactive Engagement e-Governance (IIEeGov) Model is evolved as a complimentary ICT-enabled governance framework that guides the promotion of meaningful partnership embracing all constituencies, enforcing diffusion in cyclical complementary manner; providing citizen-centric effects to shape democratic ideals;
- In the process Moore's PVM theory has been given additional impetus with the inclusion of the external authorizing environment at the local communities to aid participation and accountability.
- Evans and Wurster (2000) concept of "reach" and "richness" has been improved upon as due attention has been given to the simultaneous and concurrent development of citizens' engagement (reach) and the complex issues of technology, interactivity, customization, reliability etc. (richness).

CONCLUSIONS & SUMMARY CONT.

- Finger *et al* Theory on Co-Evolution between Tech, Inst. and Network Industries has been applied to account for local participation and inclusion that looks into the future dynamics of technology convergence and decentralised partnership.
- Misuraca, (2007) call for a dynamic framework to aid public sector reform in a multi-dimensional approach to aid knowledge development, change management mindful of culture dynamics at all levels of engagement has been supported.
- Strengthening participation of the local communities will continue to be a mark for the measurement of inclusiveness in the information society and therefore an area for continuous study.

THANK YOU